JESSICA BOYKIN-SETTLES

Two Heads Are Better Than One

The Artistry of Shirley Horn

ABSTRACT Washington, DC–born vocalist and pianist Shirley Horn was one of the most singular and respected musicians on the jazz scene during a career that spanned more than five decades. Despite minimal accolades, Horn's contributions to the art form are rarely rivaled. She was a virtuoso pianist and a genius song stylist. In a 1992 article in the *Washington Post*, prolific composer and arranger Johnny Mandel explained that "Horn's playing wasn't just self-accompaniment. It was percussive counterpart and harmonic commentary that worked with the singing to create a whole, a work of art that was more than the sum of its parts. 'It's almost as if when Shirley plays, she has two brains. I don't know how she can play what she plays and sing what she sings. . . . Playing piano like that is a very complex undertaking, and singing with that amount of sensitivity and concentration—she sounds like Siamese twins.'"[1] Through recorded performances that best exhibit vocal phrasing, chord voicings, and comping patterns in the jazz tradition, Horn's piano and vocal performance will be analyzed in order to demonstrate why her genius should occupy the top echelons of revered American musicians this country has ever produced. Jazz and classical musicians whom Horn cited as her biggest influences will be discussed to demonstrate how she absorbed and expertly integrated chosen elements of those individual styles into her own performance to create a distinctive sound and a unique approach to interpreting standard jazz repertoire. Through biographical information, Horn's career will be examined through a lens of intersectionality to discover how social categorizations such as race, class, and gender might have played a part in informing her musical and professional choices. KEYWORDS Shirley Horn, jazz vocals, jazz piano, jazz trio, jazz singer

In 2020 social issues such as racism, gender inequality, widening economic and education gaps, and the fight to reverse the deeply ingrained myth of white supremacy are front and center—forcing deep examination, discourse, and scholarship on these topics. It is on trend to claim to be "woke," a term from the African American vernacular that essentially means one is aware of social and racial justice issues. By contrast, the world was a very different place in 1934, the year that pianist and vocalist Shirley Valerie Horn was born. The Great Depression had affected nearly every American demographic, but few suffered as much as African Americans. Competition by whites for the low-paying jobs to which most African Americans were relegated was fierce and racial tensions were high. In the South there was a rise in the number of lynchings in the years following the stock market crash.[2] In the 1940s the war effort caused a shift in traditional gender roles. With the men off fighting World War II, women were filling positions that before were held by men. By the 1950s the economy had rebounded, the middle class was thriving, the baby boom was underway, and the civil rights movement had entered the mainstream with the

Resonance: The Journal of Sound and Culture, Vol. 1, Number 2, pp. 163–190. Electronic ISSN: 2688-0113

DOI: https://doi.org/10.1525/res.2020.1.2.163

1954 rendering of the Brown v. Board of Education Supreme Court decision that declared segregated public schools unconstitutional.[3]

It was against this backdrop that Shirley Horn entered the music scene, recording her debut album *Embers and Ashes* in 1960 and embarking on what would become a more than 50-year career. The world had witnessed the swift evolution of African American music since the beginning of the 20th century—yielding such treasures as the blues, ragtime, swing, bebop, and rhythm and blues—and Horn was on the verge of making a valuable contribution to the black music tradition. While jazz vocalists such as Sarah Vaughan and Carmen McRae were known to be adept pianists (both getting their professional starts as pianists in successful bands led by Earl Hines and Benny Carter) and would, on occasion, accompany themselves on a selection or two during their shows, pianist and vocalist Shirley Horn was in a league all her own. She eschewed the "norms" of the androcentric jazz world, leading her own trio for the vast majority of her career and successfully navigating an atmosphere that was notoriously unwelcoming for women who played instruments. The burden of the black female jazz musician was twofold: not only was she secondarily marginalized within a hierarchy of black male musicians, but she also had to function under the oppression of racism and white supremacy. According to Bruce Crowther and Mike Pinfold:

> In the early 1960s, things hadn't improved that much. Signed by the prestigious Joe Glaser agency, which had handled Louis Armstrong for many years, Shirley Horn went out on tour expecting anything but what she faced: "I had been working in Washington, DC, since I was a teenager, and always imagined that going on the road would be exciting and glamorous but it wasn't. We had a four-week gig at a Holiday Inn in Valparaiso, Indiana. When we arrived there, somebody told me it was the home of the Ku Klux Klan. The hotel bartender was a fan, but the audience wasn't prepared for my music. There hadn't been much jazz in Valparaiso before. The third week, I asked the hotel manager why I hadn't seen any Negro faces in the club. He smiled and said, 'That's because we ran them all out of here.'"[4]

Historically, the piano was a socially acceptable instrument for young women to play. It was an indication of "good breeding," discipline, class, and femininity. What was unexpected, however, was that a woman would be able to play in styles that were considered "masculine," such as stride, boogie-woogie, and swing. Pianists and trailblazers such as Lil Hardin Armstrong, Hazel Scott, Dorothy Donegan, and Mary Lou Williams are excellent examples of female musicians from the early jazz, swing, and bebop eras who played these styles at a high level of proficiency.[5]

Shirley Horn's ability to maintain a delicate balance between working in the mostly male jazz world while keeping her family and personal life a high priority makes her story even more fascinating. She seamlessly crisscrossed the line of the socially expected conformity to male and female gender roles—she was a working jazz instrumentalist, a bandleader, a club owner for a period of time, an avid "do-it-yourself-er" who expertly wielded a hammer and executed numerous home renovation projects. In contrast, she was also an extremely elegant woman who valued family and community above all else and who

wholeheartedly embraced womanliness, matrimony, and motherhood. She seemed to shy away from publicly speaking on the topics of racism and sexism, preferring instead to lead by example and let her music and her career/life choices do the talking for her.

Her artistry and style were a major influence on pop/jazz artists such as Diana Krall and Norah Jones, both of whom would enjoy tremendous financial gain and go on to win many industry distinctions, including Grammy Awards and a host of international awards and honors. Horn's list of awards and acknowledgements, while impressive, are minimal in comparison, despite her having recorded over 30 albums as a bandleader and dozens of other recordings as a sidewoman.[6] Composer and arranger Johnny Mandel, who first worked with Horn on the 1991 *Here's to Life* album, admired "the unique freshness and life in her voice, the wonder of the way she sang, and the incredible sensitivity to lyrics, a very literate reading of everything without being labored or stilted. And marvelous piano playing—it got me as much as the voice did."[7]

THE GREAT CITY:[8] WASHINGTON, DC, 1930S–1950S

Shirley Valerie Horn was born May 1, 1934, in Washington, DC. She would remain a District resident for most of her life, only leaving the city when health problems forced her to move into a one-level home in Upper Marlboro, Maryland, a suburb 20 miles from DC's city center. At the time of her birth, the District had led the nation for three decades in having the highest percentage of African American residents of any city. Desegregation of federal government jobs provided new opportunities and made Washington a desirable place for African Americans to live and work, despite rampant racism.[9] Segregated educational institutions such as Dunbar High School and Howard University, the crown jewel of black achievement and higher education, provided high-quality educational experiences for young African Americans. Established in 1891 and originally named the Preparatory High School for Colored Youth, Paul Lawrence Dunbar High School (named after the famed poet) was one of the first U.S. public schools for black students. The school would graduate many of the world's African American firsts and fostered an atmosphere of high achievement and excellence. Melissa Harris-Perry writes in the foreword to *First Class: The Legacy of Dunbar, America's First Black Public High School*:

> In the beginning, educating "Colored" children in DC was the private crusade of a handful of courageous white teachers. But with the founding of Dunbar High School at the turn of the twentieth century, educating black students was part of a national movement for justice and citizenship. Classically educated black pupils who knew Greek, physics, mathematics and literature were incarnate examples of the inherent equality of the races. Their excellence proved that notions of essential racial inferiority were patently false. Dunbar High School committed itself fully to the radical mission of proving black worthiness by cultivating black excellence. Dunbar had stunning achievements and produced a startling share of black leaders.[10]

It was in this atmosphere that a young Shirley Horn would be educated, challenged, and nurtured. While attending Dunbar she also attended classes at Howard University's

Junior School of Music, where she engaged in serious study of classical piano repertoire under the tutelage of Dr. Frances Hughes,[11] studying and playing pieces by the likes of classical pianist-composers Sergei Rachmaninoff and Claude Debussy. Horn discovered jazz pianist-composers Erroll Garner, Ahmad Jamal, and Oscar Peterson in middle school and was captivated by the sounds they made. She would copy their playing note for note from their records in order to learn how to play jazz. Eventually, her love for jazz would overshadow her aspirations of becoming a concert pianist; While Horn said in interviews that studying jazz did not interfere with her study of "the classics," she would eventually admit that Ahmad Jamal and Oscar Peterson had become her Rachmaninoff and Debussy. This statement is very important in that Rachmaninoff and Debussy are iconic and revered figures in Western classical music, and Horn's comparison of Jamal and Peterson to these figures shows that she held these black artists and innovators and their contributions and accomplishments in the same high esteem. Her cultural pride no doubt was bolstered by a strong and supportive family unit, the large African American demographic in DC, and her exposure to black excellence at Dunbar and Howard University. In addition to her jazz and classical piano study she maintained a steady schedule of playing piano at her church on Sundays. In high school, Shirley would begin to venture out to "sit-in" at jazz clubs, to learn the craft. Writes Bridget Arnwine:

> The reality of Horn's vision, however, was that her presence was not always welcome. "Buck [Hill][12] was the only person who was nice to me the couple of times they let me sit in," Horn says. "I didn't know anything about jazz, just what I had heard, and imitations of Erroll Garner didn't fit in with what the guys were doing then. Their attitude was, let's bear down on her." Which was the best thing for me trying to come out of the classical tradition. I was nervous, but I was stubborn.[13]

She started to pick up solo piano jobs in restaurants and clubs. It was during one of these jobs that she was convinced to incorporate singing into her act. One night, a patron brought in a huge stuffed teddy bear and said it could be hers if she would play and sing the song "My Melancholy Baby," made popular by singer Bing Crosby and, later, Judy Garland. Upon graduating from high school in 1952, Horn was offered admission and a scholarship to the prestigious Juilliard School in New York City. She never enrolled at the school; in interviews, Horn gave different reasons for why she did not attend. Sometimes she stated that her family could not afford to send her to New York City, and at other times she recalled that her parents did not want their young daughter to move so far away from home: "[Then] I got the scholarships from Xavier and from Julliard—but my mother wasn't going to let me go anywhere, you know. My father said, 'Okay,' but my mother said. 'No, you can't go to Juilliard.' There was no one living in Manhattan for me to stay with. That was a no no."[14] Ultimately, and for whatever reason(s), she turned down the opportunity to attend Juilliard and remained in Washington, DC, where she had an active performance schedule.

In 1954 she formed her own trio, and they became a familiar entity on the vibrant jazz scene in DC in the 1950s. This decade would also see Shirley meeting and marrying Sheppard Deering (to whom she remained married for the rest of her life), making her first studio

recording as one of the pianists on jazz violinist Stuff Smith's album *Cat on a Hot Fiddle,* and, in 1959, reveling in the birth of her first and only child, daughter Rainy Louise.

MILESTONES:[15] THE 1960S

Shirley Horn's debut album as a leader, *Embers and Ashes,* caught the attention of one of the leading figures in jazz, Miles Davis. In 1961, after listening to her album incessantly—so much so that his children could sing songs from the album—Miles tracked Horn down, placing a call to her mother-in-law's house in Virginia where Horn was visiting at the time. Horn initially hung up on Davis, thinking the call was a prank, but after learning that it was indeed Miles Davis calling, she agreed to visit him in New York City. There he invited Horn's trio to be the opening act for his band at the famed Village Vanguard jazz club.[16] According to Arnwine: "In fact, Davis told management at the Vanguard that if Horn didn't play, he wouldn't play. And so her rise began. The woman who some musicians perceived as an unwelcome addition to the jam sessions in Washington, DC, was now in demand."[17]

There was an added air of excitement and wonder on that opening night at the Village Vanguard; while Miles Davis and his band and Shirley Horn's trio were playing to their audience at the club, a veritable who's who of black celebrities and intelligentsia were attending the premier of the movie version of the Lorraine Hansberry[18] play *A Raisin in the Sun*. After the premier, some of them would make their way downtown to the Vanguard and it was there that Shirley Horn would get to meet some of the most well-respected African American entertainers of the time, such as Sidney Poitier and Claudia McNeil.[19]

Miles Davis's championing of Shirley Horn and their enduring friendship is a very interesting and complex relationship to explore; it has not yet been studied in depth in jazz scholarship. Davis figured very prominently in Horn's story, yet in the many books written about Miles Davis, Horn is given just a fleeting mention, if any at all.

Musically, their approaches were very similar. Both favored a breathy approach to jazz ballads in sound and phrasing—you could fit an entire lifetime in the spaces between Shirley Horn's phrases on "Just for a Thrill" and Miles Davis's "Flamenco Sketches." Both Horn and Davis liked to sing/play long notes that stretched forever and contained deep buckets of emotion within them; listen to Horn's "I Watch You Sleep" and Davis's "Blue in Green." Both Horn and Davis had an impeccable sense of time and swing as evidenced on every recording of theirs that called for that type of feel or groove. Two of my favorites to demonstrate this are Horn's "The Eagle and Me" and Davis's "Autumn Leaves."

While not wealthy, Horn enjoyed a comfortable middle-class upbringing and education. Miles Davis was born into an affluent African American family. He started taking private trumpet lessons at the age of nine. After completing high school, Davis, like Horn, was accepted to the Juilliard school, where he studied for a year and a half before dropping out to perform full time. Besides some recording sessions in the 1940s with Billy Eckstine, Sarah Vaughan, and Earl Coleman and a session in 1966 with vocalist Bob Dorough that yielded two songs, Miles Davis, as a rule, did not work with singers.

The shared experiences from their upbringings may have helped to create and deepen the bond between Horn and Davis, since they were both "learned" or educated musicians—there could often be tension among musicians who could read music and those who could not. Linda Williams writes: "The social constructs of race, gender, and class, etc. are exacerbated in the music field for women (primarily singers) who haven't studied music and who have limited [music] literacy. Formally trained musicians exhibit a general lack of respect and disregard for women who cannot read music. So sex appeal becomes the highest value placed on the female presence in the band, and their singing ability becomes secondary."[20] This would have been a nonissue for Shirley Horn and Miles Davis, as they were never romantically involved. Their love and respect for each other stemmed from their love of the music and their commitment to performing it at a high level and with the utmost of integrity.

For all of their similarities, Horn and Davis seemed to be on different ends of the spectrum in temperament and in their personal lives. From most accounts, Horn was a very social person who loved to cook and to have people over to her house for meals and for jam sessions. For many musicians, Shirley's house would be the place to go after the gig for a late night/early morning music-making session and "hang." Jazz vocalists such as Carmen McRae and Etta Jones were regular visitors to her home. The guys who played in her bands became as close as family members, with the closest of these relationships being her bandmates of more than two decades, bassist Charles Ables and drummer Steve Williams.

Shirley Horn remained happily married to Sheppard Deering for 50 years, only to be parted from him by her death in 2005. Her allegiance to and love for her daughter, Rainy, is well documented and is the reason Shirley remained close to home for the majority of her career. There was no question that family came first for Horn:

> I came from a loving family. My mother and father loved each other and I saw a lot of love. All my life I've just felt like I was in my family's arms. But I'm an emotional person and I love people. I love hard. I was kept close to home. My mother was there for me. I never had to open a door to come in by myself or anything. She was there with the food for me and I loved her dearly. That's what's wrong with a lot of situations now. There is no mother at home.[21]

Miles Davis, by contrast, was married and divorced three times, and these relationships produced four children. He was at times estranged from his children and was even jailed at one point for failure to pay child support. Davis, by his own admission, could be cruel and brutally abusive—especially to the women in his life. In a *New York Times* interview, his first wife, Frances Davis, recalled, "I actually left running for my life—more than once."[22] By many accounts, Davis could be a nice guy one minute and a tyrant the next. Biographer Quincy Troupe chalks Miles's quickly oscillating moods up to his being extremely shy and socially awkward, but he also concedes that Miles could be difficult:

> I got to know him really well as a friend but at first, he was hard to get to know and he was rough. But if he liked you, and respected you, he was great. He was a wonderful friend. He was generous, he was kind to my wife and myself, and my family. He cared

about us. And everybody else that he knew, especially the musicians who knew him well. He was a gem. But if he didn't like you, you knew it right away and you knew it forever. He didn't never want to know you and he could be rough. I mean he could put you out, curse you out. I found out later that the reason he did that was because he was very, very shy. He was a very shy person. He didn't know how to handle people. And then he found out the way to keep people off of him was just to be REALLY rough with them and they wouldn't bother him.[23]

Troupe also said:

"He was a really human, caring and funny guy. But he could switch to being an evil sonofabitch, though, if you crossed him."[24]

Horn and Davis would remain fast friends until his death in 1991, and even though he rarely performed with vocalists, he made his last recorded appearance as a sideman on the title track of Horn's 1991 release *You Won't Forget Me*. It is stunningly beautiful and a fitting end to a great jazz story. They were both masters of opposites; maybe that's why theirs was such a strong friendship. Miles, who could play such tender, thoughtful, beautiful music and be an amiable and generous man loved by his friends and family but who could also be frighteningly volatile and downright evil. Shirley, who was dogged in her determination to provide a stable and warm home for her daughter and to be a loving and devoted wife to her husband but who was an international jazz figure whose work would often take her away from home for periods of time. A woman who exuded elegance, femininity, charm, culture, and class but whose two hands were equally at home caressing, pressing, and striking the keys of a piano as they were using a saw, hammer, or drill to erect walls or build a carport next to her house.

Horn's association with Davis in the early 1960s led to a recording contract for her on a major record label (Mercury Records) and the opportunity to work with some of the top names in the music business such as Quincy Jones and John Levy (the first black personal manager in jazz; he also managed the likes of Nancy Wilson and Cannonball Adderley). She recorded two albums with Quincy Jones (*Loads of Love* and *Shirley Horn with Horns*), but their collaborative efforts did not yield commercially successful products. Horn revealed in interviews that these albums were not favorites of hers due to the fact that Jones did not allow her to play piano for herself and as a result, she was not at her best. His decision to try to turn Horn into a "stand-up" singer (standing up using a microphone instead of sitting down at the piano) was probably based more on the trend of the times and not on the fact that she was a woman. There are accounts that the same efforts were made by music executives to get Nat King Cole to become an exclusively stand-up singer. In recent interviews Quincy Jones has recounted that he regretted the way he handled Shirley Horn during those recording sessions and that the music produced from them most likely would have been better if she had been able to accompany herself. He chalks it up to him being a young producer and not really knowing Horn's style well enough to have made more informed decisions.

On her third album on the Mercury label, *Travelin' Light,* produced by bassist and arranger Johnny Pate, she once again resumed the duty of accompanying herself on

a studio recording. The hectic schedule that came with being a recording artist and touring musician kept Horn away from her husband and young daughter for long stints, and the obligations of home eventually won out to life on the road. After doing tours and promotions for *Travelin' Light*, she decided to take a break to focus on her marriage and her daughter. Based on interviews given over the years, it seems as if this was not a hard decision; Horn preferred life at home in Washington over life on the road. She was fiercely loyal to her family and friends. At a pivotal time in her career, she made the decision to make her family a priority—even though it meant a professional setback.

Historically, prescribed gender roles put women in charge of running the household and rearing the children, while the man's role was to go out into the world and work to provide financially for the family. This deeply ingrained attitude and social expectation has persisted for centuries, so it should be of no surprise that it figures very prominently in the music world. Due to the necessity of touring, working musicians spend a lot of time away from the home. For female musicians, making the choice to even start a family is given considerable thought. Some decide to completely forego having a family in favor of committing themselves fully to their careers. Traditionally, for men, these kinds of considerations do not seriously figure into their lives—they can have a family, travel, and leave the business of child-rearing to their wives or partners. It is the women who have to adjust their careers in order to be able to "have it all."

Although she was not actively touring, Horn still maintained a busy performance schedule on the DC-area jazz scene, gracing the bandstands of such historic clubs as Bohemian Caverns and One Step Down. She would not record another album until 1972, but during this time she recorded songs on the soundtracks of two major motion pictures (*For Love of Ivy* and *A Dandy in Aspic*) and remained busy playing steady gigs and even owning a jazz club at one point called The Place Where Louie Dwells.

THE SECOND TIME AROUND:[25] THE 1970S AND 1980S

The 1970s would find Shirley Horn's career on the rise. Now that her daughter, Rainy, was a little older, Horn could resume her touring and studio recording activities, and she released several albums between 1972 and 1986. She hired two musicians to round out her trio with whom she would continue to work for several decades: first, in 1970, she hired bassist Charles Ables; a decade later she added drummer Steve Williams to the mix.[26] This trio of musicians worked together until Ables's death in 2001 and as a unit solidified Horn's iconic sound.

In 1980 an impromptu performance at a *JazzTimes*[27] convention in Washington, DC, set off a chain of events of that eventually landed Horn a recording contract with Verve Records, a major jazz recording label. Horn enjoyed a banner year in 1987 when she released the album *I Thought About You: Live at Vine Street,* which marked the beginning of her "comeback." Prior to this, Horn had not had a contract with a major record label since 1965's *Travelin' Light* on ABC-Paramount, although between the years of 1965 and

1987 she released several albums on smaller labels Steeplechase (a Dutch label), Audiofile, and Perception. She was also awarded the Mayor's Arts Award for Excellence in an Artistic Discipline by DC's mayor in the same year.

I'VE GOT THE WORLD ON A STRING:[28] THE 1990S AND 2000S

The 1990s proved to be a fruitful time in Shirley Horn's career. She recorded several albums in the 1990s and 2000s, including *Here's to Life,* her 1991 collaborative masterpiece with composer and arranger Johnny Mandel that incorporated a full orchestra. Prior to bringing in the orchestra, Horn's trio recorded performances of all of the song selections from the album, and Mandel wrote and arranged the orchestra parts around what the trio had recorded. Everything fits together seamlessly, with the orchestra magnifying the beautiful foundation that Horn and her trio had laid. Her rendition of "Here's to Life" remains the most definitive version of this song in spite of its being covered by top-tier vocalists Barbara Streisand and Patti Labelle. Eli Zeger wrote in an article for the *Financial Times*: "Whether backed by a full orchestra or lone grand piano, singers have used 'Here's to Life' to evoke a quietly transportive, reflective mood. It has served as a meditation for those entering their later years—a musical acknowledgment of all they've been through, but that more lies ahead. However, none has delivered this conviction with as much force and majesty as Horn, whose version remains paramount."[29] She received many accolades, including France's Académie du Jazz's Billie Holiday Award in 1990 and the Phineas Newborn, Jr. Award in 1999 for her decades of contributions to jazz.

Horn's rendering of "Here's to Life" spent ten weeks on the Billboard charts—eight of those weeks at the number one spot—and it was nominated in the category "Best Jazz Vocal Performance" at the 35th Annual Grammy Awards in 1993. Horn was slighted and the Grammy prize that year went to jazz vocalist Bobby McFerrin's recording of "'Round Midnight" on the duo album *Play* with pianist Chick Corea in spite of that album's having spent only six weeks on the Billboard charts, peaking at number three. Horn was, however, awarded the Edison Populair HR57 Award for *Here's to Life* in 1993.

Although Shirley Horn was the recipient of five DC regional Wammie Awards between 1985 and 1992, she won her first and only Grammy Award in 1999 for *I Remember Miles*, an album she recorded to pay tribute to Miles Davis, who died in 1991. She was honored in a 2004 tribute at the Kennedy Center and won the nation's highest honor in jazz, the NEA's Jazz Master Award in 2005—the same year she succumbed to complications from diabetes. Posthumously, in 2006, she was officially recognized by the 109th U.S, Congress:

> Shirley Horn's voice and piano had a profound effect on her listeners around the world. Now, therefore, be it resolved by the House of Representatives (the Senate concurring), that Congress . . . recognizes Shirley Horn's many achievements and contributions to the world of jazz and American culture and notes the loss to American culture with her passing.[30]

NICE 'N EASY:[31] THE VOCAL ARTISTRY OF SHIRLEY HORN

One of the most distinctive voices in the jazz genre, Horn's approach to singing was that of the utmost patience and care—nothing frivolous or wasted. She was a master of phrasing,[32] and her vocal instrument had the ability to whisper and coo one moment, growl and roar the next. Phrasing is a very important element in jazz singing, and mastery of effective phrasing can take a jazz performance to the highest level of personal interpretation and audience enjoyment and engagement. Ron Browning wrote in *Voice Council Magazine*:

> The singer's job is to phrase the song so they spotlight drama as it rises and falls. This is achieved with bold, creative phrasing. Phrasing refers to the way a singer chooses to divide the lyric into groups of words to allow for clarity of the storyline, efficient breathing, and dramatic effect. Most singers are content to use generic phrasing, dictated by the punctuation that the songwriter placed in the text. Although accurate, such phrasing often leads to predictable and emotionless singing. The professional singer might overlook the suggested markings and add special effects and different vocal colors to keywords, making them leap out of the vocal line demanding attention. This allows the singer to superimpose their personal point of view onto the story. The audience hears the songwriter's story while the subtext shows the artist's take on it.[33]

While Shirley Horn cited vocalists Peggy Lee, Billie Holiday, Ella Fitzgerald, Sarah Vaughan, Joe Williams, Louis Armstrong, and Lena Horne as singers she admired, Horn's singing defies the listener to pinpoint a main vocal influence. However, connections can be made to stylistic elements of her Baptist church upbringing and her interpretation of lyrics in the style of singers such as Billie Holiday and Dinah Washington. While still some years away from the intricate melismas, riffs, and runs that have come to characterize contemporary Gospel music vocality, Horn was coming of age and being exposed to sacred music during a time of transition in the black church tradition. Beginning in the late 1930s and early 1940s, the music was evolving from more traditional hymn singing being the norm into the sounds of the blues-tinged Gospel tradition.

Shirley Horn had a three-octave range, extending from a C1 (one octave below middle C; appears as the first sung note on both recordings of the song "Estate") up to a C4 (one octave above middle C; appears as the last note on "Wild Is the Wind). To put it in perspective, the average vocalist has a two- to two-and-a-half-octave range. Horn was able to use this comparatively wide range to mine a variety of vocal effects to create an array of emotions while singing.

Horn was widely regarded as one of the greatest song stylists in jazz. "She famously probed the depths of lyrics while putting emphasis on the space and time between phrases," said Ed Gordon in a 2005 radio tribute.[34] This was a skill she admired in Billie Holiday, stating during an interview with Katea Stitt for the Smithsonian's Jazz Oral History project, "Her use of space, time. Her time was magnificent. I mean it wasn't one, two, three, four, one, two. It was one, one, one."[35] Horn was a master interpreter of lyrics. She has been quoted as saying, "I want you to feel what I feel. I want you to see the picture I'm trying to paint. I want you to be beside me. Be inside me. That's the way I feel."[36] She

was so adept at "painting a picture" that she could transfix audiences in small jazz clubs as well as at larger jazz festival venues.

Shirley Horn was known to be a woman of few words, loathe to do interviews or a lot of talking from the bandstand during shows, preferring just to sing and let the music speak for itself. This in turn translated to singing that was understated, tasteful, and never overdone, since the very act of jazz singing is wholly connected to the singer and, ideally, should be an extension of the individual. Her vocal performance is reminiscent of the way Miles Davis played and phrased melodies. According to Gerald Lyn Early:

> Horn's spare haunting way with lyrics, the space where a note lingers, and the way she drives a dramatic tension between voice and piano all help us hear Miles Davis' horn as a female voice. On the one hand, his influence on her seemed clear. On the other hand, perhaps he heard his voice in the way she handled a lyric and in her phrasing. Miles recorded " . . . Baby, Won't You Please Come Home," "I Fall in Love Too Easily," and Basin Street Blues" on the *Seven Steps to Heaven* album after hearing Shirley Horn sing them at the Village Vanguard.[37]

Horn's unique rhythmic approach to vocally interpreting standard jazz repertoire ran the gamut from articulating a flawless "in-the-pocket" swing feel with very clear entrances or vocal onsets on definite beats of the bar—coyly playing with the time, delivering and phrasing the lyric in a more conversational speed totally independent of the groove, feel, or rhythmic foundation underneath the vocal—to a minimalistic approach that seemed to suspend time altogether. Mike Joyce wrote in the *Washington Post*, "She can say volumes with a few notes, or none at all, and her unusual control of the beat, which seems to disappear altogether at times, allows for the exceptional freedom of phrasing that gives so many of these performances a compelling drama."[38]

THE MUSIC THAT MAKES ME DANCE:[39] THE PIANO ARTISTRY OF SHIRLEY HORN

The act of "comping" makes up the bulk of the contribution of a jazz pianist's performance in a combo or ensemble setting. To "comp" (short for accompany) means to provide a harmonic, rhythmic, and textural foundation to which the melody and improvised solos can be added. In most forms of popular music there is not much variation in the accompaniment that the pianist provides under the soloist. For example, listen to the original recording of pop vocalist Adele's "Someone Like You" from January 2011 and then listen to a live version from a recent concert. You will hear the same piano accompaniment with little to no rhythmic or harmonic variation from the original. This is much different from what happens in the jazz idiom. Even if the song being performed is a specific written arrangement, there will inevitably be some sort of departure from the original; variations in the accompaniment can range from ever so slight (a subtly altered piano voicing, an unwritten piano fill in response to some musical happening contributed by the soloist or another member of the ensemble, an improvised comping rhythm inspired by a figure played by the drummer) to more adventurous (a total reharmonization of the original chord changes, a change of groove or "feel," or an elongated solo

section or ending). The concept of "call and response" present in much of the music from the African diaspora is one of the pillars of the jazz tradition. Learning to be a good listener is a necessary skill of a good accompanist. A working knowledge of basic musical concepts is also needed; many elements come together to create the musical experience: intensity, dynamics, rhythmic considerations, style/"feel"/groove (blues, Bossa Nova, swing, straight eighth, Afro-Cuban, etc.).

During different performances of the same song, the soloist (instrumental or vocal) will never (if they are a jazz performer worth their salt) perform the melody or "head" of the song the same way or play the exact same musical ideas during the improvised solo section. The band then responds to what the soloist plays or sings with complementing musical ideas that support what the soloist has played. The main goal in jazz is to always be creating spontaneous music in the moment. This is what makes each performance special and exciting for the listener and the performers alike. The mark of a great jazz piano accompanist is that they don't "get in the way" while still providing a good source of harmonic structure for the soloist.

Elemental considerations of jazz piano playing include (a) touch—dynamics, texture, emotion, (b) harmony—piano voicings, chord changes, and (c) rhythm. Shirley Horn's attention to each of these essentials and the way she used them collectively created her unique style. Below is a discussion of each of these elements, how the pianists Horn cited as her main influences—Claude Debussy, Sergei Rachmaninoff, Oscar Peterson, Erroll Garner, and Ahmad Jamal—executed these elements, and how they show up in Horn's piano playing.

Touch

Just as a person can have a distinct speaking or singing voice, instrumentalists can also develop distinctive "voices" on their respective instruments. Lester Young's sound or voice on the tenor saxophone is very different from Ben Webster's; Clifford Brown's sound is distinguishable from Miles Davis's.[40] Whereas these differences in sound or tone on woodwind and brass instruments can be achieved by individual approaches to forming the embouchure,[41] varying degrees of breath support, choice of mouthpiece, and the onset, release, or articulation of the notes—and different physical interactions with the piano—can produce different tones and sounds as well. In addition, a specific turn of phrase, ornamentation of notes, and the choice of language or vocabulary can also set an instrumentalist apart from players of the same instrument. Certain phrases or "licks"[42] can be attributed to certain instrumentalists and can make their playing distinguishable from others.

Touch is a way that a pianist can define their individual sound. It may seem curious that different musicians can pry distinct sounds out of an instrument like the piano, but the key to producing a unique sound first has much to do with one's approach to "touching" the keys. "Touch on a piano is an interesting thing; a lot of times it's not what someone plays, it's how they play it," says Joey Calderazzo .[43] Touch is affected by how the fingers are placed on the piano and how much force is asserted on the keys. According to Werner Goel:

> Pianists control the timing and velocities of the individual piano hammers by varying the forces applied to the piano key surfaces, as well as to the three pedals through their feet. The key forces are accomplished by coordinating the kinematic chain from their shoulders to the fingertips aligned with feet movements to manipulate the pedals. As kinematic properties such as finger velocity covary with performance parameters (tempo, dynamics, etc.), pianists have to stabilize several parameters of movement kinematics and musical expression simultaneously. The intrinsic way the fingers arrive at the piano key surface, referred to as piano touch (i.e., pressing versus striking a piano key), yields different tactile and other sensory percepts to the pianists themselves and the audiences alike, making this parameter an important one in accomplished piano performance.[44]

Jazz pianist Red Garland's touch was described as "delicate," Elmo Hope's as "dynamic," and Ahmad Jamal's as "nimble." Shirley Horn's touch on the piano has been described as "supple" and "delicate." Her chords just seem to shimmer and sparkle. Her classical training and years of playing music in all kinds of settings (church, clubs, other venues) enabled Horn to become intimately acquainted with the piano and to be able to discover various sounds, dynamics, and textures. On the opposite end of the spectrum, she was also able to get a big and powerful sound out of the piano, a skill she attributed to the teachings of her teacher at Howard University, Frances Hughes. Horn used a range of colors and dynamics in order to convey various emotions and moods.

In examining this element in the piano styles of Horn's main classical influences, Rachmaninoff and Debussy, we can identify which of these Horn internalized and adopted into her style. Rachmaninoff (who had a great admiration for jazz piano virtuoso Art Tatum, who is considered one the best pianists who ever lived) had very large hands and amazed audiences and critics alike with his touch, power, and virtuosity. It was said that his hands were able to span a twelfth (an octave and a half or, for example, a stretch from middle C to high G).[45] Just as Horn was known for eliciting a range of emotions from the piano, Rachmaninoff had a very strong emotional attachment to the music, often attributed to his Russian sentimentality, even to the point of being considered "schmaltzy" by some. Through her studies of Debussy, Horn would have learned how to make the piano produce different sounds using different approaches to "touching" the piano keys, as Debussy was very clear in his descriptions of how to play certain passages of his compositions in order to produce the desired sound effect. For example, instructions such as, "Keep your left hand hanging loosely from your wrist. Then let it drop, and let the tip of your third finger play those notes" and "Play with more sensitiveness in the fingertips. Play chords as if the the keys were being attracted to your fingertips, and rose to your hands as to a magnet."[46] While Debussy's touch was described as "light," he believed that the fingers should always be firm.[47]

Horn's main jazz piano influences—Ahmad Jamal, Oscar Peterson, and Erroll Garner—were miles apart stylistically. Jamal and Peterson both favored a lighter touch while Garner, although capable of using a lighter touch, preferred a more aggressive heavy-handed approach. As Nat Pierce, one of Garner's closest pianist friends, said, "He wasn't a piano player in the strict sense, but he mastered a totally unorthodox technique. He

would beat the keyboard to death, using all the wrong fingering—where you were supposed to put the thumb under, he might just keep using the index finger—but out would come all those gorgeous melodies."[48] Horn's use of Garner's "heavy-handed" approach is probably most evident when she plays a tune in the 12-bar blues form.

Oscar Peterson's touch "could be light and feathery; as ethereal as a memory."[49] A disciple of jazz pianists Art Tatum, Count Basie, and Nat King Cole, Peterson's incredible dexterity allowed him to play intricate patterns at breakneck speed all while maintaining an impeccable swing feel. At times he was panned by critics who accused him of not really having a style of his own and opined that he relied too heavily on his virtuosity and flawless technique and as a result, his music tended to lack emotion and soul. Those opinions aside, his light touch on the piano and his ability to "fade into the background" when appropriate made Oscar Peterson a sought-after accompanist for some of the top vocalists of the day, and he played for such luminaries as Louis Armstrong, Ella Fitzgerald, Billie Holiday, and Bill Henderson.

Harmony

Shirley Horn's chord voicings have been described in such terms as "atmospheric," "instinctual," "sensitive," and "thoughtfully original." Over the years she developed a sound that was incredibly pleasing and instantly recognizable among informed jazz listeners. A quick overview of the compositional and pianistic styles of Horn's influences can give some insight into possible reasons she made certain stylistic choices. It is interesting to note that both Sergei Rachmaninoff and Claude Debussy were heavily influenced by early jazz and bebop harmonies and rhythms; in turn, many jazz musicians were also inspired and influenced by their compositions. It is well documented that Rachmaninoff was a huge Art Tatum fan, often attending his shows at New York City jazz clubs and even remarking that Tatum was the best piano player of any style. He told the press that if Tatum "ever decides to play serious music, we are all in trouble."[50] Rachmaninoff used jazz-inspired harmony in his later compositions; his Fourth Piano Concerto was a blend of jazz, Russian folk music, Orthodox chant, and modernist tonal harmony. As Michael Clive notes, "The slow movement sounds almost like blues."[51] Rachmaninoff also favored 7^{th} and 9^{th} chords, which are used extensively in jazz harmony.

Rachmaninoff's extremely large hands and his ability to stretch more than an octave contributed to his writing passages that utilized parallel open fifths and octaves. Playing this type of literature during her early music studies could very well have contributed to Horn's prominent use of right-hand octaves, as she would have become proficient at executing this technique in a confident manner. In order to get a big "fat" sound on the piano, this is a device that Shirley utilized on a regular basis. Horn's "Rachmaninoff" pianist Oscar Peterson also had enormous hands that could easily span the length of a tenth on the piano, and he could play large right-hand voicings and melodies voiced in octaves with complete accuracy at high speeds.

Claude Debussy's use of harmonic devices such as the whole-tone scale, pentatonic scales, and 9, 11, and 13 chords are reminiscent of extended jazz harmony. Debussy was also influenced by early jazz and ragtime when he wrote his controversial "Golliwogs

Cakewalk"[52] (from the *Children's Corner* suite) in 1908. His use of bitonal[53] chords could possibly have been an early source of Horn's exposure to this type of harmony and one of the inspirations behind her use of polychord[54] harmony.

Ahmad Jamal's classical piano studies are apparent in his orchestral approach and his expert use of tension and release. Highly melodic improvisation and deceptively simple embellishments were elements of his style. As Marc Myers wrote in the *Wall Street Journal*, "Mr. Jamal's distinctive style—melodies played on the piano's upper-most notes combined with elegant and brief mid-keyboard chord clusters—had been revered by jazz musicians since his first recordings in 1951."[55] Jamal's sparse, economical comping and use of the upper range of the piano to create crisp tinkling voicings are evident in Horn's playing; of all her main influences, Jamal's impact is probably the most apparent in Horn's overall style.

Erroll Garner also used an orchestral approach to the piano, favoring tremolos and the use of octaves in the right hand. This was a technique that Shirley Horn employed regularly, especially during improvisational solos and when she performed tunes in the blues tradition. Oscar Peterson's harmonic sense seems to have been informed in large part by his admiration for Art Tatum: "More than any other pianist, Oscar Peterson has inherited the harmonic conception and awesome technique of Art Tatum, his mentor and early idol."[56] Peterson's solid grounding in swing and bebop language along with his natural musicality and virtuosic technique enabled him to create exciting and imaginative improvised solos, trio arrangements, and accompaniment behind vocalists and soloists. While not reaching the same heights of Oscar Peterson's dizzying speed and technique (Tatum and Peterson were two of the absolute best jazz pianists of the 20th century, and no has really matched their piano prowess since then), Shirley Horn was well versed in swing, bebop, and blues language, firing off melodic lines during solos that incorporated elements learned from Peterson. His techniques for arranging songs for piano trio can also be found in Horn's recordings.

Rhythm

Horn was one of the most "swinging-est" jazz piano players of all time. While the term *swing* remains an elusive concept to define, the feeling that one gets upon hearing it done "right" is unmistakable. In other words, one does not necessarily have to be a jazz connoisseur in order to recognize good swing. Horn's sense of rhythm was complex in that she could "swing" with the best and in varied tempos from medium to up-tempo swing, yet she could play a ballad in a tempo so slow that time seems to stand still and stretch all at the same time.

Ahmad Jamal's (Horn's "Debussy") rhythmic approach on ballads, swing, and Latin tunes alike was one of leaving lots of space, a preference he shared with both Shirley Horn and her mentor and friend Miles Davis. Eugene Holley Jr. writes: "Jamal is a true scientist of sound: his use of space and dynamics, along with his tight, intricate arrangements, were a big influence on generations of pianists from Ramsey Lewis to Jacky Terrasson. In his autobiography, Miles Davis declared that Jamal 'knocked me out with his concept of space, his lightness of touch, his understatement, and the way he phrases notes and chords and passages.'"[57]

Erroll Garner employed a unique rhythmic approach that at times implied multiple "time feels" happening simultaneously: "He developed a signature style that involved his right hand playing behind the beat while his left strummed a steady rhythm and punctuation, creating insouciance and tension."[58] This style of playing fostered total independence of the left and right hands. Through studying Garner's piano style, Horn would have gained the ability to play in a way that allowed her to disengage the left from the right hand. This skill could also have been transferred to vocal mechanism so that she was able to produce the effect of three independent entities—the voice, the left hand, and the right hand thereby enabling her to accompany herself and have it sound like a separate pianist.

A BEAUTIFUL FRIENDSHIP:[59] SHIRLEY HORN'S TWO HEADS

Critic Jon Pareles wrote in 1988:

> Songs are lucky when Shirley Horn chooses them. She honors melodies just by singing them unadorned, in a voice of honey and smoke; she enunciates every word, shaping small and large peaks with just a slight pause or a lingering vowel. Accompanying herself on piano, she renders harmonies in economical chords, sustained or neatly articulated. And when the time comes to improvise, the song's emotion guides her; she drapes lyrics in bluesy curves and finds epiphanies in tender phrases.[60]

Horn made magic on the piano, and she was able to do it all while singing with very sophisticated style and phrasing, executing all of these elements simultaneously while having them be totally independent of each other. This was no easy feat, as there are many processes involved in each of these tasks.

Singing is a highly complex process that depends upon the coordination of various organs and muscles in the respiratory, neuromuscular, laryngeal, articulatory, and resonating systems. Sound originating in the larynx, is shaped and amplified when it comes into contact with surfaces in the throat and skull and is formed into language by articulators—among which are the tongue, teeth, and lips. Singing differs from speech in that the rhythms, duration of tones, and pitches produced in singing usually correlate to notated music. Good vocal technique and the ability to execute a variety of pitches, rhythms, dynamics, and tonal colors can be developed through individual practice, with the ultimate goal being to produce a tone that is pleasing to the ear.[61]

The coordination involved in playing the piano requires that the right and left hands be able perform separate tasks. According to Julia Turan:

> Coordination of limbs is an evolutionarily ancient skill, shared by both vertebrates and invertebrates alike. All animals that use limbs to walk or swim or fly do so in a coordinated fashion. For us humans, taking part in many activities such as sports or music mean using our limbs in context-dependent ways. Consider the pianist. She presses on smooth black and white keys, hundreds of muscles are whirring away inside her body, and her brain is performing complicated emotional and analytical processes. Although every independent movement of the pianist's hands is one she'll make while

doing other tasks, their coordination yields a unique product: music. The pianist's strategies to generate and optimize her performance are constrained by her muscular and nervous systems. Coordinating her right and left hands is just one of the tasks her brain needs to carry out while playing music. Most piano music requires your left and right hands to perform radically different motor tasks (with varying degrees of complexity; Bach is a particularly good example of hands going in opposite directions).[62]

Shirley Horn's ability to have complete independence of her left and right hands while playing complicated rhythms on the piano that adhered to swing, ballad, and Latin styles—coaxing a multitude of textures and dynamics out of the piano—in addition to her ability to sing sophisticated phrasing with flawless vocal technique was a tremendous feat, and she was one of the best to ever do it. Horn's idol, Oscar Peterson, was also an able vocalist (influenced by Nat King Cole) who recorded several albums on which he accompanied himself: *Romance: The Vocal Styling of Oscar Peterson* (1954), *With Respect to Nat* (1965) and *The Personal Touch* (1980). His piano technique was second to none, but he found playing and singing a monumental task to attempt and admitted that he did not think he was very good at it:

"I think I would have made a much better job if I didn't play for myself because I found that while singing, I was very involved in what I played for myself on the piano. You know, I'd be singing a lyric and I'd be saying to myself, I don't like that voicing . . . it's too thick or it isn't thick enough or it's in the wrong range. I did a couple of things where someone else played for me and I didn't like that either. So I basically decided that this instrument is enough of a challenge. It's more than two hands full."[63]

HERE'S LOOKING AT YOU:[64] ANALYSIS OF RECORDINGS

In order to give examples of Horn's artistry and to illustrate the concepts discussed in the above sections, this section will examine four recordings of two songs from standard jazz repertoire. "Something Happens to Me" (from the album *Where Are You Going?* (1973), with the second version taken from a live concert in Bern, Switzerland, in 1990 via YouTube,[65] and "Wild Is the Wind" from Shirley Horn's debut album *Embers and Ashes* (1960),[66] with the second version of the same song from a live performance at New York's famed Village Vanguard jazz club in 1991.[67]

Since Horn had several "signature" songs that she would perform and record regularly throughout her career, I initially had the idea to analyze a recording from her first commercial release as a bandleader in 1960, *Embers and Ashes*, and then compare it to a recording of the same song from a performance or recording close to the latter part of her career to examine any similarities and/or differences in her approach to playing and singing the same piece in different eras. I was not able to meet these exact criteria but was still able to access material that was at least close to two decades apart in one example and three decades in the next. Each pair of recordings demonstrates the progression and maturation of Shirley Horn's vocal and pianistic styles. How did her style change in the

course of these years, or was she a fully formed artist at the time she made her first recording in 1960? It is important to note that the loss of Horn's right foot in 2001 from complications due to diabetes prevented her from accompanying herself on the piano, since she was not able to work the piano pedals. In late 2004, with the use of a prosthetic, she was able to once again assume piano duties. For the purpose of this study I have eliminated audio and video recordings where Horn is not accompanying herself, hence the reason for not using the recordings produced by Quincy Jones in the 1960s in which she was not allowed to play for herself owing to Jones's misguided attempt to have Horn be a "stand-up singer."

"Something Happens to Me" – *Where Are You Going?* (Perception, 1973)

Personnel: Shirley Horn (p, v); Al Gafa (g); Marshall Hawkins (b); Bernard Sweetney (d)

Key: F major; metronome marking: q = 125

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=v_vnOauqB3Y

This song, written by Marvin Fisher and Jack Segal (first recorded and released by Nat King Cole in 1959; Shirley Horn recorded it in 1972 and released it on her recording *Where Are You Going?* in 1973),[68] describes a romantic connection between two people that is so cosmically strong, they are astonished that they are able to physically sense when the other is near and will appear. This recording is Horn's first studio album since 1965, when she took a hiatus from touring to focus on her family. A review of her discography shows that her bandmates on this recording, bassist Marshall Hawkins and drummer Bernard Sweetney, had also appeared on Horn's preceding album *Travelin' Light* (Mercury Records, 1965), establishing that the trio had been performing together for at least seven years.

Horn's impeccable sense of time and swing[69] on "Something Happens to Me" are demonstrated in the rhythmic accuracy of her vocal phrasing and piano comping figures. It is no surprise that this song would remain in her repertoire for the remainder of her career, as she was inclined to choose repertoire with lyrics composed of strong imagery with a leaning toward the romantic. Even though she did not begin her career as a vocalist, Horn's delivery is confident, demonstrating an infallible vocal technique and command of her vocal mechanism[70] that employs the use of several types of vocal qualities (breathy, focused/clear, and even vocal growls—a stylistic nod to jazz singers such as Louis Armstrong and Cab Calloway and blues singer Bessie Smith and a style that is also employed in the blues and gospel vocal traditions). She uses very crisp diction, accurate intonation, and variations in dynamics, especially toward the end of the arrangement when she goes into what I call the wind-up, a unique arranging approach in which—once reaching the end of the song form—Horn would then repeat the last section or the last two sections of the form several times at the end (for example, if the song form is A-A-B-A then she would repeat or loop B-A), building in intensity with each new iteration for dramatic effect. She skillfully utilizes dynamics and varies the melody and the interpretation of the lyric each time. By the time she reaches the last time through the wind-up she is utilizing her full voice, even using a belting vocal quality on the word *tell*. Though Horn didn't use

this vocal quality often in performance, she possessed the technique to do so. During a 1992 interview with NPR's Terry Gross when Gross referred to Shirley's voice as being "a small voice" Horn replied, "Well, I'll tell you like this: I can scream. You know it kind of depends on the song and the songs that I like, that I lean toward, need a soft approach. There are some boisterous . . . I've done some singing. . . . You would be surprised. I don't prefer it."[71] Also present in this recording is the playful yet elegant sensuality that would characterize her music for years to come. Horn's use of the soft *piano* dynamic at the very beginning of the song urges the listener to lean in and get closer . . . so that she can whisper in their ear; her delivery of the word *feel*—with its overemphasized beginning consonant and lingering, drawn-out vowels—conjures up an image of a meaningful touch between two lovers.

This quartet recording of "Something Happens to Me," which includes the addition of a guitar to the band, is a rarity in the Shirley Horn canon. Guitarist Al Gafa and Horn work very well together, with Al doing an expert job of inserting comping chords only when Shirley leaves the space to do so and providing fills at times between phrases and sections. For inexperienced chordal instrumentalists, this has the potential to produce a performance that is "crowded" with too much comping that could therefore become a jumble of sound, but that is not the case in this recording. It is important to note that on recordings prior to 1987's *I Thought About You: Live at Vine St.*, Horn rarely plays single-line piano fills in between phrases but instead occasionally fills the spaces with comped chords. This does not detract from the performance and does not sound as if something is missing, but when she does begin to incorporate this element into her performances, as on the same song "Something Happens to Me" on the *Live at Vine St.* recording, it adds another layer to an already impressive offering and establishes the evolution of Horn's piano playing.

Reharmonization in the form of adding "color" tones to chords is used frequently by Horn and is one of the hallmarks of her style that may have been inspired by her exposure to the music of Debussy at a young age and then by the jazz pianists she later studied. Ahmad Jamal had a very keen ear for producing elegant and tasteful chord changes and reharmonizations.

Another strong element in Horn's playing is her anticipation of the following measure by playing the chord on the upbeat of beat four in the current measure. This provides the feeling of forward motion and is a technique commonly used in swing music.

"Something Happens to Me" – International Jazz Festival – Bern, Switzerland, 1990 (YouTube video)

Personnel: Shirley Horn (p, v); Charles Ables (b); Steve Williams (d)

Key: F major; metronome marking: q = 135

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=INsLeBrFPKM

This performance sees a definite change in tempo, as it is done at a faster clip than the original. Both are in the key of F major, and Horn has not lowered the key from the original recording 30 years earlier. The absence of deterioration of the voice demonstrates

that Horn employed excellent vocal technique. Her voice has gained more depth in this recording in contrast to the first, but it continues to be vibrant and healthy-sounding. Her delivery is calmer but has not lost any of the hard swing to which her listeners were accustomed. At this time she was working with her rhythm section of Charles Ables and Steve Williams, and they had been together for 20 years and 10 years, respectively.

This performance is longer than the earlier recording of the song, as Horn has extended the form and added an additional chorus before going to the wind-up.

Horn's phrasing is rhythmically fluid, alternating between phrases starting on a down- or upbeat and phrases that are not quantified in terms of rhythmic accuracy but that float over and through the measures—more concerned with the lyric idea than the "swing" feel. In spite of the looser phrasing, the recording maintains a very strong sense of swing.

Her rhythmic approach to comping does not exhibit a drastic change from the first recording of this song in 1960, although it tends to at times be a little busier than the first recording in that respect. What is noticeably different is that she now plays added blues-inspired piano fills in between phrases.

"Wild Is the Wind" – *Embers and Ashes* (Stereo-Craft Records, 1960)

Personnel: Shirley Horn (p, v); Joe Benjamin (b); Herbie Lovelle (d)

Key: C minor; metronome marking: q = 85

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=8OcoTkGorcM

"Wild Is the Wind" is a song written by Russian composer Dmitri Tiomkin and American lyricist Ned Washington. It is the title song from the 1957 movie of the same name and was originally recorded by Johnny Mathis. Another famous rendition of the composition was recorded by Nina Simone in 1959. The lyrics of the song compare love to being wild and free like the wind and express a deep longing to be connected with the one you love. Horn's version of this song opens with a couple of sparse chords, the bassist playing simple roots of the chords and Shirley's half-sung/half-whispered delivery of the opening lyrics. The drums enter on the cymbals before launching into an ostinato figure played with mallets. A Latin groove is implied although not fully realized, leaving more space for Horn to interpret the melody and lyrics without being locked into a tight rhythmic groove. Here again, she delivers the lyrics with impeccable diction, making sure to include very clear consonants at the end of each word. She is unhurried, holding notes at the end of some phrases for the duration of two measures or not holding them at all and leaving an open space that sometimes lasts for an entire measure or two. There are no unnecessary vocal melismas or ad libs; her main focus is on delivering the lyrics and melody in an honest fashion. She employs a very breathy vocal tone—as if she herself is the "wind" about which she is singing. She plays chords consistently on the first and third beats of each bar with extreme rhythmic accuracy. There are no piano fills between phrases and no varying of the comping rhythms, although her vocal phrasing ebbs and flows without adhering to the rhythmic constraints of the instrumental accompaniment. The groove remains steady and doesn't vary until the very end, when there are held chords at the last four measures of the song form. She throws in a twist on the harmonic

structure of the song at the very end when instead of finishing on the tonic major chord, she employs a portion of what is known as the Tadd Dameron Turn-Around[72] and ends on the bVI major 7 chord (a tritone and chord quality substitution of the ii min7 chord).

"Wild Is the Wind" – Live at the Village Vanguard (DVD) (12:10–19:58) October/ November 1991

Personnel: Shirley Horn (p, v); Charles Ables (b); Steve Williams (d)

Key: C minor; metronome marking: q = 62

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=JuGgKK1IPmc&t=745s

The Shirley Horn trio played at the famed Village Vanguard jazz club in New York City from October 29 to November 3, 1991. This video recording is from one of those nights of performances. The first time Shirley played at this venue was when she opened for Miles Davis's ensemble in May 1961. Just a couple of months prior to this date she recorded "Wild Is the Wind" on the *Here's to Life* album, orchestrated and conducted by Johnny Mandel.

This performance opens with a rubato solo piano introduction in which Horn plays the melody, sometimes by itself as one line played with the right hand and accompanying chord voicings in the left; other times she harmonizes it with deliciously dissonant block chords. She discreetly signals her band when she is ready to dive into the head of the song. A couple of measures into the A section, she gives another discreet signal—this time to her drummer. She very lightly taps the top of the piano with her right fingers to let him know that she would like for him to play the rhythmic figure with the mallets; this figure is prominent in her first recording of this song from 30 years prior but is, interestingly, not as present in the 1991 recording (*Here's to Life*). While still compelling in its own right, the tempo of the 1960 recording is much faster than this version. The slower pace demonstrates a more mature approach to the material, with Horn leaving her trademark "lifetime" of space in between the sung phrases—reminiscent of her mentor Miles Davis. Vocally, she uses a more focused vocal tone, as if she has learned over the years that she is "enough" and does not have to resort to vocal manipulation in order to convey the meaning of a song.

Her comping rhythm is still mainly on the first and third beats of the measure as in the original recording, but the playing is much more fluid and she uses more fills in between voicings as well as more "color" tones such as 11s, 9s, etc. She also scatters and sprinkles octaves on top of her voicings in which you can hear the obvious influence of pianist Ahmad Jamal.

MAY THE MUSIC NEVER END:[73] CONCLUSION

For female jazz musicians the fight against sexism continues, prompting initiatives that have given rise to jazz festivals that feature mainly female performers and events such as Jazz Girls Day, which encourages more young girls to participate in jazz. Yet there does not seem to be the same urgent push for more African American girls and women to have

that same representation in jazz. For female African American jazz musicians, their fight includes the fight against racism as well as sexism. The number of black girls and women playing in jazz ensembles is small compared to the same white demographic. This can be attributed to several factors, one being the education gap. In 50 years, the wide education gap between African Americans and whites has barely budged. Black students still do not have the resources and access that white students are granted. This includes access to private music lessons and formal music training in grades K–12. It is well known that exposure to the arts helps to strengthen academic achievement and aids in creating well-rounded human beings, yet in some areas heavily populated by African Americans and other people of color who are considered low- to middle income, there is little to no access to adequate arts education. Part of the reason Shirley Horn was able to have so much confidence and to gain and maintain her position in the jazz world was that she was a formally trained musician. Today's young African American women who have not had that kind of access are being denied the opportunity to participate in jazz at the same level and frequency as their white counterparts.

Historically, the battle for gender equality has excluded African American women.[74] Author, musician, and ethnomusicologist Linda F. Williams recounts:

> "When I told older heads that I was writing a book, which explored, among other things, my generation of black women's precarious relationship with feminism, they looked at me like I was trying to re-invent the wheel. I got lectured ad nauseam about 'the racism of the White Feminist Movement,' 'the sixties and seventies,' and 'feminism's historic irrelevance to black folks.'" The older generation made sure that she was reminded of how feminism's ivory tower elitism excludes the masses . . . and that black women simply "didn't have time for all that shit."[75]

While women have to be strong to survive on the jazz scene, it is hard to imagine a woman having much success if she gets a reputation for being difficult to work with. One can wonder what kind of career Shirley Horn would have had if she had possessed a temperament akin to Miles Davis or Charles Mingus, who was known to have a notoriously explosive temper. This is yet another mantle that women have to bear—the necessity of having to be "liked" or to assume a mothering role in order to form friendships with male musicians and continue to secure steady gigs. Eric Porter writes:

> Even for well-respected players in the jazz community such as Melba Liston and Mary Lou Williams, participation and acceptance in jazz circles sometimes depended upon their ability to double in a 'maternal' role. According to Valerie Wilmer, Williams's Harlem apartment was a place where musicians gathered for 'appreciation, help and understanding' as well as the exchange of musical ideas. Melba Liston is said to have kept a pot on the stove for hungry musicians, some of whom used her apartment as a mailing address.[76]

Shirley Horn encapsulated the entire history of jazz singing and piano playing. She was a complete musician who set the standard for self-accompanied jazz vocalists. Much like Louis Armstrong, whose singing was very closely tied to his horn playing and vice versa, the piano was an extension of Shirley Horn's voice; this effect created a sound that was

seamlessly integrated. Part of her genius was the way she was able to absorb and then synthesize certain elements of style from the musicians and vocalists she admired to create a style and sound that was totally unique.

Horn was a master of the balancing act: balancing the left hand with the right; balancing the roaring style of Erroll Garner with the delicate style of Ahmad Jamal; balancing her personal life with the demands of her performing career; balancing the no-nonsense part of her that needed to be tough to make sure that she was being dealt with fairly by club owners, managers, journalists, and musicians with the part of her that was soft, nurturing, and sensual—elements that gave her music its added depth and captivated her audiences.

Composer Artie Butler first met Horn in 1991 at the recording session for the album *Here's to Life*. He recounts: "They had to pick me up off the floor—I was in tears. When someone sings your song with a performance of that magnitude, it levels you."[77] Butler's sentiment mirrors that of many of Horn's admirers. She was the consummate musician who embodied everything that makes a great artist: a flawless sound, a profound and honest connection to the music, virtuosic instrumental ability that is made to look effortless, and a willingness and ability to continue to expand said talents and abilities. Favoring elegantly voiced chords, hard-swinging medium- and up-tempo tunes, impossibly slow ballads, and sensual Latin-tinged refrains, the influences of the classical composers she studied as a youth and the jazz pianists she studied as a young adult were always evident. Her uncanny ability to comp rhythmically intricate patterns while vocally interpreting lyrics and melodies totally independent from her piano playing was indisputable.

From her beginnings in the Washington, DC, public school system and at the mecca of higher education, Howard University, Horn was given an exemplary academic and arts education that was rooted in black excellence. She carried those teachings, pride in her culture, and expectation of excellence throughout her career.

Some ideas for future research related to the life and music of Shirley Horn could include a study and comparison of the playing styles and careers of female jazz pianists from the early 1900s to the present. Questions to be explored might include whether ageism played a part in their successes or failures, how their experiences differed or were similar, if racism has been a bigger detriment to the success of black musicians than sexism, if any of the above has informed what kind of repertoire they have chosen to perform, and what impact their career has had on their personal lives. ■

NOTES

1. Richard Harrington, "Something in the Way She Sings," *Washington Post*, October 18, 1992. Retrieved from https://www.washingtonpost.com/archive/lifestyle/magazine/1992/10/18/the-wonder-of-the-way-she-sings/0c7687ae-6962-4aae-acaf-98f16d01acd7/.
2. Cheryl Lynn Greenberg, *To Ask for an Equal Chance: African Americans in the Great Depression* (Lanham, MD: Rowan & Littlefield Publishers, 2009).
3. Mary Beth Norton et al., *A People and a Nation: A History of the United States* (Stamford, CT: Cengage Learning, 2015).
4. Bruce Crowther and Mike Pinfold, *Singing Jazz: The Singers and Their Styles* (San Francisco: Miller Freeman Books, 1997).

5. Lil Hardin Armstrong (1898–1971) was a jazz pianist, composer, arranger, singer, and bandleader. She was the second wife of Louis Armstrong, with whom she collaborated on many recordings in the 1920s.

   Hazel Scott (1920–1981) was a prominent jazz pianist and singer throughout the 1930s and 1940s. In 1950 she became the first black American to host her own TV show, *The Hazel Scott Show*. An outspoken critic of racial discrimination and segregation, she used her career and fame in the United States to improve the representation of black Americans in film. Her career in America faltered after she testified before the House Un-American Activities Committee during the McCarthy era.

   Dorothy Donegan (1922–1998) was an American jazz pianist and vocalist, primarily known for performing in the stride piano and boogie-woogie style. She also played bebop, swing jazz, and classical music.

   Mary Lou Williams (born Mary Elfrieda Scruggs; 1910–1981) was an American jazz pianist, arranger, and composer. She wrote hundreds of compositions and arrangements and recorded more than 100 records (in 78, 45, and LP versions). Williams wrote and arranged for Duke Ellington and Benny Goodman, and she was friend, mentor, and teacher to Thelonious Monk, Charlie Parker, Miles Davis, Tadd Dameron, Bud Powell, and Dizzy Gillespie.
6. Sidewoman (or sideman): a professional musician hired to perform or record with a band.
7. Harrington, "Something in the Way She Sings," 1992.
8. Song written by Curtis Lewis; found on these recordings: *Shirley Horn with Horns, The Garden of the Blues*, and *I Thought About You: Live at Vine St.*
9. Marya Annette McQuirter, "African Americans in Washington, DC: 1800–1975," in *African American Heritage Trail: Washington, DC* (Cultural Tourism DC, 2003). Retrieved from https://www.culturaltourismdc.org/portal/c/document_library/get_file?uuid=e9ded752-0908-42f5-9d30-e4b01555db39&groupId=701982.
10. Melissa Harris-Perry, foreword to A. Stewart, *First Class: The Legacy of Dunbar, America's First Black Public High School* (Chicago: Lawrence Hill Books, 2013), vii–x.
11. "The teacher I remember there (Howard University) most is Dr. Frances Hughes. I'll never forget her. I was afraid of her at first, but I respected her because she was a positive teacher. You know what I mean? She started me right off with Chopin. Didn't give me any little dingle-ingle-ingle stuff and I loved it" (from Lara Pellegrinelli, "Around the Horn with Shirley Horn," *JazzTimes*, May 2001). Hughes spent most of her teaching career in the Washington, DC, area where she was a university music instructor, public school teacher, counselor, and principal. She was known for creating ways to expose children to music and the creative arts. She once launched a crusade to give inner-city youngsters free guitar lessons, and she founded the DC Youth Chorale. Rose State College instituted the Frances White Hughes Memorial Scholarship fund with a $547,000 trust she bequeathed the school upon her death. (*Rose State College 15th Street News*, August 2007.)
12. Roger Wendell "Buck" Hill (1927–2017) was an American jazz tenor and soprano saxophonist. He began playing professionally in 1943 but held a day job as a mail carrier in his birthplace of Washington, DC, for over 30 years. He played with Charlie Byrd in 1958–59 but was only occasionally active during the 1960s. He began recording extensively as a leader in the 1970s and continued recording with others, such as an album with the Washington-area trumpeter Allan Houser in 1973.
13. Bridget Arnwine, "The Beautiful Struggle: A Look at Women Who Have Helped Shape the DC Jazz Scene," in *DC Jazz: Stories of Jazz Music in Washington, DC,* eds. Maurice Jackson and Ruble Blair (Washington, DC: Georgetown University Press, 2018).
14. Lara Pellegrinelli, "Shirley Horn: Around the Horn with Shirley, *JazzTimes*, 2001. Retrieved from https://jazztimes.com/archives/shirley-horn-around-the-horn-with-shirley/.
15. Miles Davis composition and title of 1958 album.

16. Opened in 1935, the Village Vanguard, located in New York City's Greenwich Village neighborhood, is the oldest continuously operated jazz club in the world.
17. Arnwine, "The Beautiful Struggle," 2018.
18. Lorraine Hansberry was the first black woman to have a play produced on Broadway and the first African American to win the New York Drama Critics' Circle Award.
19. Margot Stage, producer, *Jazz Profiles from NPR: Shirley Horn*, National Public Radio. Retrieved from https://www.npr.org/programs/jazzprofiles/archive/horn_s.html.
20. Linda F. Williams, "Black Women, Jazz and Feminism," in *Black Women and Music: More than the Blues,* ed. E. Hayes (Champaign: University of Illinois Press, 2007).
21. Pellegrinelli, "Shirley Horn," 2001.
22. Pat H. Broeski, "Wrestling with Miles Davis and His Demons," *New York Times,* November 19, 2006. Retrieved from https://www.nytimes.com/2006/11/19/movies/19broe.html.
23. Evie Hemphill, producer, "St. Louis Native Quincy Troup Reflects on Miles Davis' Music, Friendship," *St. Louis on the Air*, St. Louis Public Radio/National Public Radio, February 2019. Retrieved from https://news.stlpublicradio.org/post/st-louis-native-quincy-troupe-reflects-miles-davis-music-friendship#stream/0.
24. Andrew Dansby, "The Two Sides of Miles Davis," *Rolling Stone,* May 31, 2000. Retrieved from https://www.rollingstone.com/music/music-news/the-two-sides-of-miles-davis-205219/.
25. Song composed by Sammy Kahn and Jimmy Van Heusen; found on these recordings: *Loads of Love, At the Gaslight Square.*
26. Guitarist and bassist Charles Ables (1943–2001) died of cancer. He was formerly a guitarist in Ray Charles's band. When he learned that Shirley Horn was looking for a bassist for her band, he learned to play the electric bass with the sole intention of getting Horn to hire him. He was a member of her band for more than 30 years (*JazzTimes* archives, 2001).

    Stephen Edward Williams (born January 7, 1956) is an American jazz drummer. For 25 years he collaborated with Shirley Horn.
27. American magazine devoted to jazz; founded in 1970 in Washington, DC, by record store owner Ira Davidson Sabin.
28. Song by Harold Arlen and Ted Koehler, found on these recordings: *All of Me* (1987), *Sarah—Dedicated to You* (2003; Carmen McRae (v); Shirley Horn (p), *Live at the Village Vanguard* (DVD, released 2007), *Live at the 2004 Monterey Jazz Festival* (released 2008).
29. Eli Zeger, "Here's to Life—'A Meditation for Those Entering Their Later Years,'" *Financial Times*, September 18, 2018. Retrieved from https://ig.ft.com/life-of-a-song/heres-to-life.html.
30. House of Representatives Concurrent Resolution 300, 109th Congress (2006).
31. Song written by Alan Bergman, Marilyn Keith, and Lew Spence; found on the recordings *I Thought About You: Live at Vine St.* (1987), *Live at the Village Vanguard* (DVD, released 2007), *Fresh Air with Terry Gross*, National Public Radio broadcast (1992), *Live at the 2004 Monterey Jazz Festival* (released 2008).
32. "Phrasing is pervasive from the beginning and end of a note; how you articulate the note . . . legato vs staccato and everything in between; the end of a note like whether you [use] vibrato or cut it off or let the note fade away; time feel meaning the swinging eighth note, which is the essence of jazz rhythm and swing, nuance . . . which makes each artist unique . . . meaning in essence, the way each individual speaks and gestures. Like in real life, nobody talks the same or expresses themselves the same. For example, the use of nuance for a vocalist might be a particular way you might end a note with breathiness or a 'fall-off'" (David Liebman, *Interview: Phrasing and Jazz Vocalists*. Retrieved from https://davidliebman.com/home/ed_articles/interview-phrasing-and-jazz-vocalists/.
33. R. Browning, "How Dynamic Is Your Phrasing?" *Voice Council Magazine,* May 24, 2017. Retrieved from http://www.voicecouncil.com/dynamic-vocal-phrasing-ron-browning/.

34. Ed Gordon, "A Tribute to Jazz Vocalist Shirley Horn," *News and Notes,* National Public Radio, October 24, 2005. Retrieved from https://www.npr.org/templates/story/story.php?storyId=4971276.
35. Katea Stitt, *Smithsonian Jazz Oral History Program: Shirley Horn*, June 13–14, 1996. Retrieved from https://amhistory.si.edu/archives/AC0808_Horn_Shirley_Transcript.pdf.
36. Stage, *Jazz Profiles from NPR: Shirley Horn*.
37. Gerald Lyn Early, *Miles Davis and American Culture* (St. Louis: Missouri Historical Society, 2001).
38. Mike Joyce, "Rediscovering Shirley Horn," *Washington Post*, April 23, 1989. Retrieved from https://www.washingtonpost.com/archive/lifestyle/style/1989/04/23/rediscovering-shirley-horn/b5f1199d-65c1-4e27-9492-7ebe8b11b937/.
39. Song written by Jule Styne and Rob Merrill; found on the recording *You Won't Forget Me* (1991).
40. Lester Willis Young (1909–59), nicknamed Pres or Prez, was an American jazz tenor saxophonist and occasional clarinetist.

    Benjamin Francis Webster (1909–73) was an American jazz tenor saxophonist. He is considered one of the three most important "swing tenors," along with Coleman Hawkins and Lester Young.

    Clifford Benjamin Brown (1930–56) was an American jazz trumpeter. He died in a car accident at age 25, leaving behind four years' worth of recordings. He was also a composer of note; his compositions "Sandu," "Joy Spring," and "Daahoud" have become jazz standards.
41. Embouchure: the position of the lips, teeth, and tongue when playing a wind instrument. Also can refer to the mouthpiece used to play the instrument.
42. Lick: a term used in jazz, blues, and pop music to describe a short, recognizable melodic motif, formula, or phrase. Improvising jazz and blues musicians have at their disposal a repertory of licks, some of their own invention by which they can be identified, some borrowed from other players, and a solo may be little more than the stringing together of a number of such fragments. (Robert Witmer; https://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/grovemusic/search?q=lick&searchBtn=Search&isQuickSearch=true.)
43. Joey Calderazzo, "Artist's Choice: Joey Calderazzo on Current Jazz Pianists." *Jazztimes,* 2015. Retrieved from https://jazztimes.com/features/lists/artists-choice-joey-calderazzo-on-current-jazz-pianists/.
44. Werner Goel, "Movement and Touch in Piano Performance," in *The Handbook of Human Motion* ed. B. Müller et al. (Cham, Switzerland: Springer, 2017), 1–18. Retrieved from https://link.springer.com/referenceworkentry/10.1007%2F978-3-319-30808-1_109-1.
45. Manoj Ramachandran and Jeffrey Aronson, "The Diagnosis of Art: Rachmaninov's Hand Span," *Journal of the Royal Society of Medicine* 99, no. 10 (October 2006). Retrieved from https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC1592053/.
46. Maurice Dumesnil, *How to Play and Teach Debussy* (New York: Schroeder & Gunther, 1932).
47. Karstein Djupdal, "Technique and Touch," in *A Piano Method by Claude Debussy*. Retrieved from http://www.djupdal.org/karstein/debussy/method/m09.shtml.
48. Leonard Feather, "Piano Giants of Jazz: Erroll Garner," *Contemporary Keyboard Magazine*, April 1977. Retrieved from https://www.keyboardmag.com/lessons/weekend-chops-builder-piano-giants-of-jazz-erroll-garner.
49. Richard Harrington, "Oscar Peterson: A True Giant of Jazz Piano," *Seattle Times*, December 27, 2007. Retrieved from https://www.seattletimes.com/entertainment/oscar-peterson-a-true-giant-of-jazz-piano/.
50. Roy Wooten, "Classical Music Meets American Jazz (Demo)," National Museum of African American Music (blog), April 20, 2016. Retrieved from https://nmaam.org/2016/04/20/classical-music-meets-american-jazz/.

51. Michael Clive, "Rachmaninoff—Concerto No. 4 in G Minor for Piano and Orchestra, op. 40," Utah Symphony program notes, 2019. Retrieved from https://utahsymphony.org/explore/2019/04/rachmaninoff-concerto-no-4-in-g-minor-for-piano-and-orchestra-op-40/.
52. "The Golliwog (originally spelled Golliwogg) is the least known of the major anti-black caricatures in the United States. Golliwogs are grotesque creatures with very dark, often jet-black skin, large white-rimmed eyes, red or white clown lips, and wild, frizzy hair. The Golliwog began life as a storybook character created by Florence Kate Upton in 1895." https://www.ferris.edu/jimcrow/golliwog/.
53. Bitonal: using two musical tonalities simultaneously.
54. Polychord: a bichord or polychord consists of two or more chords, one on top of the other.
55. Marc Myers, "A New Architecture for Jazz," *Wall Street Journal*, September 28, 2013. https://www.wsj.com/articles/a-new-architecture-for-jazz-1380332959.
56. Steven A. Cerra, "Oscar Peterson—Bursting Out," *Jazz Profiles* (blog), November 26, 2014. Retrieved from http://jazzprofiles.blogspot.com/2014/11/oscar-peterson-bursting-out.html.
57. Ernest Holley Jr., "Pianist Ahmad Jamal Charted a New Popularity for Jazz.," *WaxPoetics* (blog), May 16, 2018. Retrieved from https://www.waxpoetics.com/blog/features/articles/pianist-ahmad-jamal-charted-new-popularity-jazz/.
58. "Eric Garner Trio," AM 880 KIXI (blog). Retrieved from https://live.kixi.com/listen/artist/f252e5a6-1a4b-41be-af84-8d8b6f339e9b.
59. "A Beautiful Friendship," written by Donald Kahn and Stanley Styne, can be found on the Shirley Horn recording *Close Enough for Love* (Verve, 1989) and Marian McPartland's *Piano Jazz* radio broadcast (1994).
60. Jon Pareles, "Shirley Horn's Epiphanies," *New York Times*, November 10, 1988. Retrieved from https://www.nytimes.com/1988/11/10/arts/review-jazz-shirley-horn-s-epiphanies.html.
61. J. Mathew, "An Examination of the Mind-Body Coordination of Vocal Technique (honors thesis, University of South Florida, 2011).
62. Julia Turan, "Bimanual Labor: The Neuroscience of Piano Playing," *NeuWrite West* (blog), March 9, 2016. Retrieved from http://www.neuwritewest.org/blog/j530f20hhqudhxu3kxx5jg256dq5di.
63. Studs Terkel, "Oscar Peterson Plays and Discusses Jazz," (radio interview), September 8, 1961. Retrieved from https://studsterkel.wfmt.com/programs/oscar-peterson-plays-and-discusses-jazz.
64. "Here's Looking at You" was written by Carroll Coates and can be found on the Shirley Horn recording *The Main Ingredient* (Verve, 1996). This album was recorded at Horn's home in Northeast Washington, DC.
65. "Shirley Horn in Concert, Bern 1990" (last part, "Something Happens to Me," Thejazzsingers Channel, YouTube (May 1, 2010) [video file]. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=INsLeBrFPKM.
66. Dmitri Tiomkin (composer) and Ned Washington (lyricist), "Wild is the Wind," recorded by Shirley Horn, on *Embers and Ashes* (CD) (New York: Stere-O-Craft, 1961).
67. Gene Davis (director), *Shirley Horn Live at the Village Vanguard* (DVD) (New York: Image Entertainment, 2007).
68. Marvin Fisher (composer) and Jack Segal (lyricist), (1958). "Something Happens to Me," recorded by Shirley Horn, on *Where Are You Going?* (CD) (New York: Perception, 1973).
69. Swing: a quality attributed to jazz performance. Though basic to the perception and performance of jazz, swing has resisted concise definition or description. Most attempts at such refer to it as primarily a rhythmic phenomenon, resulting from the conflict between a fixed pulse and the wide variety of accent and rubato that a jazz performer plays against it. However, such a conflict alone does not necessarily produce swing, and a rhythm section may even play a simple fixed pulse with varied amounts or types of swing. Clearly other properties are also

involved, of which one is probably the forward propulsion imparted to each note by a jazz player through manipulation of timbre, attack, vibrato, intonation, or other means; this combines with the proper rhythmic placement of each note to produce swing in a great variety of ways. (J. Bradford Robinson: https://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000027219?rskey=QxunIR&result=3.)

70. "The muscles, cartilages and organs belonging to the respiratory system and alimentary canal that, adapted to the vocal process, give rise to the 'voice.' Since the respiratory system and alimentary canal contain within themselves all of the properties requisite to the sounding of muscle tone, i.e., an actuator (neurological impulses and/or breath pressure), a vibrator (the vocal folds), and a resonator or series of resonators (the trachea, larynx, oropharynx and mouth), they are readily adaptable for service as a tone-producing musical instrument. These vocal *organs* as they have come to be called, are capable of producing the widest variety of tone qualities ranging from the ugly to the beautiful, and when used with skill, musical sensitivity and poetic imagination, are superior to all mechanical instruments." C. Reid, *A Dictionary of Vocal Terminology* (New York: Music House, 1983).
71. Terry Gross, "Shirley Horn in Concert," *Fresh Air,* National Public Radio, June 29, 1992. Retrieved from https://freshairarchive.org/segments/shirley-horn-concert.
72. The Tadd Dameron turnaround, named for the pianist and composer, is a very common form in the jazz idiom, derived from a typical I–vi–ii–V turnaround through the application of tritone substitution of all but the first chord. Dameron was the first composer to use the turnaround in his standard "Lady Bird."
73. "May the Music Never End" was written by Norman Martin and Artie Butler and can be found on the Shirley Horn recording *May the Music Never End* (Verve, 2003).
74. Katherine Soules, "'Playing like a Man': The Struggle of Black Women in Jazz and the Feminist Movement" (senior capstone project, Cedarville University, 2011). Digital Commons @ Cedarville.
75. Linda F. Williams, "Black Women, Jazz and Feminism," in *Black Women and Music: More than the Blues,* ed. E. Hayes (Champaign: University of Illinois Press, 2007).
76. Eric Porter, *What Is This Thing Called Jazz? African American Musicians as Artists, Critics and Activists* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002).
77. Richard Harrington, "Renowned Shirley Horn Keeps 'Blowing,'" *Chicago Tribune*, December 28, 2004. Retrieved from https://www.chicagotribune.com/news/ct-xpm-2004-12-28-0412280069-story.html.